

1 ROB BONTA
2 Attorney General of California
3 ABIGAIL BLODGETT
Supervising Deputy Attorney General
3 STACY J. LAU (SBN 254507)
4 Deputy Attorney General
1515 Clay Street, 20th Floor
5 P.O. Box 70550
Oakland, CA 94612-0550
6 Telephone: (510) 879-1973
Fax: (510) 622-2270
7 E-mail: Stacy.Lau@doj.ca.gov

8 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of California*

9 *[Additional counsel listed on signature page]*

10
11 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
12 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
 SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

13 **STATE OF CALIFORNIA, STATE OF**
14 **NEW YORK, COMMONWEALTH OF**
15 **PENNSYLVANIA, STATE OF**
16 **COLORADO, STATE OF**
17 **CONNECTICUT, STATE OF**
18 **DELAWARE, STATE OF ILLINOIS,**
19 **STATE OF MAINE, STATE OF**
20 **MARYLAND, PEOPLE OF THE STATE**
21 **OF MICHIGAN, STATE OF NEW**
22 **JERSEY, STATE OF NEW MEXICO,**
23 **STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA, STATE**
24 **OF OREGON, STATE OF RHODE**
25 **ISLAND, STATE OF VERMONT, STATE**
26 **OF WASHINGTON, DISTRICT OF**
27 **COLUMBIA, CITY OF NEW YORK, and**
28 **the BAY AREA AIR QUALITY**
 MANAGEMENT DISTRICT,

Plaintiffs,

v.

25 **UNITED STATES POSTAL SERVICE,**
26 **and LOUIS DEJOY, in his official capacity**
27 **as United States Postmaster General,**

Defendants.

Case Nos. 3:22-cv-02583-RFL
3:22-cv-02576-RFL

**ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION TO
CONSIDER WHETHER ANOTHER
PARTY'S MATERIALS SHOULD BE
SEALED**

**CLEANAIRNOW; CENTER FOR
BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY; and SIERRA
CLUB,**

Plaintiffs,

V.

**LOUIS DEJOY, in his official capacity as
U.S. Postmaster General; and U.S. POSTAL
SERVICE,**

Defendants.

Pursuant to Civil Local Rules 7-11 and 79-5(f), Plaintiffs hereby bring this Administrative Motion to Consider Whether Another Party’s Material Should Be Sealed in connection with Plaintiffs’ Consolidated Motion for Summary Judgment filed on May 24, 2024. Plaintiffs understand that Defendants United States Postal Service and Louis DeJoy, in his official capacity as United States Postmaster General (“Defendants”) may claim that Plaintiffs’ motion, which cites administrative record material that Defendants have marked “Confidential,” contains confidential information. Thus, Plaintiffs have conditionally filed a redacted version of their Consolidated Motion for Summary Judgment. Plaintiffs file this motion to afford Defendants the opportunity to file any statement and/or declaration in support of sealing that it deems necessary in accordance with Civil Local Rule 79-5(f)(3).

Under Civil Local Rule 79-5(f), when a party seeks to seal a document that has been designated as confidential by another party or non-party, the moving party must file a Motion to Consider Whether Another Party's Material Should Be Sealed. The motion must "identify each document or portions thereof for which sealing is sought." Civ. L.R. 79-5(f)(1). "Within 7 days of the motion's filing, the Designating Party must file a statement and/or declaration as described in [Civil Local Rule 79-5(c)(1)]." Civ. L.R. 79-5(f)(3). "If any party wishes to file a response, it must do so no later than 4 days after the Designating Party files its statement and/or declaration." Civ. L.R. 79-5(f)(4).

1 Plaintiffs respectfully request that the Court consider whether the following information in
2 Plaintiffs' Consolidated Motion for Summary Judgment should remain redacted:

- 3 • Page 22, lines 24-26
4 • Page 23, lines 8-11
5 • Page 24, lines 5-7
6 • Page 24, lines 12-13
7 • Page 24, lines 15-21
8 • Page 25, lines 6-9
9 • Page 30, lines 1-3
10 • Page 32, footnote 9, lines 1-3
11 • Page 38, lines 26-27

12
13 The identified information quotes and/or references administrative record material that
14 was marked "Confidential" and "Subject to Protective Order" pursuant to the parties' Stipulated
15 Protective Order. *See* Dkt. 77 in Case No. 3:22-cv-02576-RFL; Dkt. 151 in Case No. 3:22-cv-
16 02583-RFL. Attached to this motion is an unredacted copy of Plaintiffs' Consolidated Motion for
17 Summary Judgment, with the proposed redactions highlighted in blue, for this Court's
18 consideration.

19 In compliance with Local Rule 5-1(h), the filer of this document attests that all signatories
20 listed have concurred in the filing of this document.

21
22 Dated: May 24, 2024

Respectfully submitted,

23
24
25
26
27
28

1
2 ROB BONTA
3 Attorney General of California
4 ABIGAIL BLODGETT
Supervising Deputy Attorney General

5 */s/ Stacy J. Lau*
6 STACY J. LAU
Deputy Attorneys General
1515 Clay Street, 20th Floor
7 P.O. Box 70550
Oakland, CA 94612-0550
8 Telephone: (510) 879-1973
E-mail: Stacy.Lau@doj.ca.gov

9
10 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of California*

11
12 FOR THE COMMONWEALTH OF
13 PENNSYLVANIA
14 MICHELLE A. HENRY
Attorney General

15 */s/ Ann R. Johnston*
16 ANN R. JOHNSTON
Assistant Chief Deputy Attorney General
17 Office of Attorney General
Civil Environmental Enforcement Unit
18 Strawberry Square
14th Floor
19 Harrisburg, PA 17120
Email: ajohnston@attorneygeneral.gov
(717) 497-3678

20
21 *Attorneys for Plaintiff*
22 *Commonwealth of Pennsylvania*

23
24 LETITIA JAMES
25 Attorney General of New York

26 */s/ Claiborne E. Walthall*
27 CLAIBORNE E. WALTHALL (*pro hac vice*)
28 Assistant Attorney General
New York State Office of the Attorney General
Environmental Protection Bureau
State Capitol
Albany, NY 12224
(518) 776-2380
claiborne.walthall@ag.ny.gov

29
30 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of New York*

31
32 WILLIAM TONG
33 Attorney General of Connecticut

34 */s/ Daniel Salton*
35 DANIEL SALTON
36 Assistant Attorney General
37 Office of the Attorney General of Connecticut
165 Capitol Avenue
38 Hartford, CT 06106
Telephone: (860) 808-5250
Email: daniel.salton@ct.gov

39
40 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Connecticut*

1 KATHLEEN JENNINGS
2 Attorney General of Delaware

3 /s/ Vanessa L. Kassab
4 CHRISTIAN DOUGLAS WRIGHT
5 Director of Impact Litigation
6 VANESSA L. KASSAB (*pro hac vice*)
7 JAMESON A. L. TWEEDIE
8 RALPH K. DURSTEIN, III
9 Deputy Attorneys General
Delaware Department of Justice
820 N. French Street
Wilmington, DE 19801
(302) 683-8899

10 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Delaware*

11 KWAME RAOUL
12 Attorney General of Illinois

13 /s/ Jason E. James
14 JASON E. JAMES (*pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
15 MATTHEW J. DUNN
Chief, Environmental Enforcement/Asbestos
Litigation Division
16 Office of the Attorney General
201 West Pointe Drive, Suite 7
17 Belleville, IL 62226
Tel: (872) 276-3583
18 Email: Jason.james@ilag.gov

19 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Illinois*

20
21 MATTHEW J. PLATKIN
22 Attorney General of New Jersey

23 /s/ Lisa Morelli
24 LISA MORELLI, State Bar No. 137092
Deputy Attorney General
Division of Law
25 Market Street
P.O. Box 093
26 Trenton, NJ 08625-093
Telephone: 609-376-2740
27 Email: lisa.morelli@law.njoag.gov

28 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of New Jersey*

AARON M. FREY
Attorney General of Maine

/s/ Jillian R. O'Brien
JILLIAN R. O'BRIEN, Cal. State Bar No. 251311
JASON ANTON
PAUL SUITTER
Assistant Attorneys General
Six State House Station
Augusta, Maine 04333-0006
Telephone: (207) 626-8800
Fax: (207) 287-3145
Email: Jason.Anton@maine.gov
Email: Paul.Suitter@maine.gov
Email: Jill.Obrien@maine.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Maine

ANTHONY G. BROWN
Attorney General of Maryland

/s/ Steven J. Goldstein
STEVEN J. GOLDSTEIN (*pro hac vice*)
Special Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
200 Saint Paul Place, 20th Floor
Baltimore, Maryland 21202
Telephone: (410) 576-6414
Email: sgoldstein@oag.state.md.us

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Maryland

RAÚL TORREZ
Attorney General of New Mexico

/s/ William Grantham
WILLIAM GRANTHAM (*pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
201 Third St. NW, Suite 300
Albuquerque, NM 87102
Telephone: (505) 717-3520
E-Mail: wgrantham@nmag.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of New Mexico

1 FOR THE STATE OF OREGON

2 ELLEN F. ROSENBLUM
3 ATTORNEY GENERAL

4 /s/ Paul Garrahan

PAUL GARRAHAN (*pro hac vice*)
5 Attorney-in-Charge
STEVE NOVICK (*pro hac vice*)
6 Special Assistant Attorney General
Natural Resources Section
Oregon Department of Justice
7 1162 Court Street NE
Salem, Oregon 97301-4096
(503) 947-4540
Paul.Garrahan@doj.oregon.gov
Steve.Novick@doj.oregon.gov

8
9
10 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Oregon*

11
12
13 FOR THE PEOPLE OF THE
14 STATE OF MICHIGAN

15 /s/ Elizabeth Morrisseau

ELIZABETH MORRISSEAU (*pro hac vice*)
16 Assistant Attorney General
17 Environment, Natural Resources,
and Agriculture Division
Michigan Attorney General's Office
18 6th Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building
525 West Ottawa Street
PO Box 30755
19 Lansing, MI 48933
Telephone: (517) 335-7664
Email: MorrisseauE@michigan.gov

20
21 *Attorneys for Plaintiff the People of the State of*
Michigan

JOSHUA H. STEIN
Attorney General of North Carolina

/s/ Francisco Benzoni

ASHER SPILLER
Assistant Attorney General
FRANCISCO BENZONI
Special Deputy Attorney General
114. W. Edenton Street
Raleigh, NC 27063
Telephone: (919)716-7600
Email: fbenzoni@ncdoj.gov
aspiller@ncdoj.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of North Carolina

ROBERT W. FERGUSON
Attorney General of Washington

/s/ Megan Sallomi

MEGAN SALLOMI, State Bar. No. 300580
Assistant Attorney General
Environmental Protection Division
Washington State Attorney General's Office
800 5th Ave Suite 2000,
Seattle, WA 98104-3188
Telephone: (206) 389-2437
Email: Megan.Sallomi@atg.ca.gov

Attorney for Plaintiff State of Washington

PETER F. NERONHA
Attorney General of Rhode Island

/s/ Nicholas M. Vaz

NICHOLAS M. VAZ (*pro hac vice*)
Special Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
Environmental and Energy Unit
150 South Main Street
Providence, Rhode Island 02903
Telephone: (401) 274-4400 ext. 2297
nvaz@riag.ri.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Rhode Island

1 CHARITY R. CLARK
2 Attorney General of Vermont

3 /s/ Ryan Kane
4 RYAN KANE (*pro hac vice*)
5 Assistant Attorney General
6 Office of the Attorney General
7 109 State Street
Montpelier, VT 05609
(802) 828-2153
ryan.kane@vermont.gov

8 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Vermont*

9
10 BRIAN L. SCHWALB
11 Attorney General for the District of Columbia

12 /s/ Adam Teitelbaum
13 ADAM TEITELBAUM, State Bar. No. 310565
14 Deputy Director
15 Office of the Attorney General
District of Columbia
400 6th St. NW
Washington, DC 20001
Telephone: 202-256-3713
Email: Adam.Teitelbaum@dc.gov

16 *Attorneys for Plaintiff District of Columbia*

17
18 HON. SYLVIA O. HINDS-RADIX
19 Corporation Counsel
20 of the City of New York

21 /s/ Alice R. Baker
22 ALICE R. BAKER (*pro hac vice*)
Senior Counsel
New York City Law Department
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
Telephone: (212) 356-2314
E-mail: albaker@law.nyc.gov

23 *Attorneys for Plaintiff City of New York*

ALEXANDER G. CROCKETT
District Counsel

24 /s/ Marcia L. Raymond
25 MARCIA L. RAYMOND, State Bar No. 215655
Assistant Counsel
26 Bay Area Air Quality Management District
350 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5158
mraymond@baaqmd.gov

27 *Attorneys for Plaintiff
Bay Area Air Quality Management District*

28 PHILIP J. WEISER
Attorney General of Colorado

/s/ Carrie Noteboom
CARRIE NOTEBOOM (*pro hac vice*)
Assistant Deputy Attorney General
Natural Resources and Environment Section
Colorado Department of Law
1300 Broadway, 7th Floor
Denver, CO 80203
(720) 508 6285
carrie.noteboom@coag.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Colorado

/s/ Adriano L. Martinez
ADRIANO L. MARTINEZ (SBN 237152)
YASMINE L. AGELIDIS (SBN 321967)
CANDICE L. YOUNGBLOOD (SBN 328843)
amartinez@earthjustice.org
yagelidis@earthjustice.org
cyoungblood@earthjustice.org
Earthjustice
707 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 4300
Los Angeles, CA 90017
T: (415) 217-2000 / F: (415) 217-2040

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs CleanAirNow
and Sierra Club*

1 */s/ Scott B. Hochberg*
2 MAYA D. GOLDEN-KRASNER (SBN 217557)
3 SCOTT B. HOCHBERG (SBN 305567)
4 mgoldenkrasner@biologicaldiversity.org
5 shochberg@biologicaldiversity.org
6 Climate Law Institute
7 Center for Biological Diversity
8 1212 Broadway, Suite 800
9 Oakland, CA 94612
10 T: (510) 844-7119 / F: (510) 844-7150

11
12 *Attorneys for Plaintiff Center for*
13 *Biological Diversity*
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 **ATTESTATION PURSUANT TO CIVIL LOCAL RULE 5-1**

2 I hereby certify that the above counsel in Case Nos. 3:22-cv-02583 and 3:22-cv-02576
3 have concurred in the filing of this document.

4

5 */s/ Stacy J. Lau*
6 Stacy J. Lau

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

761004667.1

1 **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

2 I hereby certify that, on May 24, 2024, I electronically filed the foregoing document with
3 the Clerk of the Court using the ECF System, which will send notification of such filing to all
4 counsel of record by operation of the Court's ECF System.

5 */s/ Adriano L. Martinez*
6 Adriano L. Martinez

7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

761004667.1